

Resettlement action plan of Lagos red rail line and project affected persons' (PAPs) perception



Gab Abolaji Jamiu ATOBATELE

Department of Public Administration

Ahmadu Bello University

Zaria, Nigeria

abolaji561@gmail.com

Olayinka OLUWASEUN

Department of Computer Science

Federal Polytechnic

Ilaro, Nigeria

olayinka.olaiya@federalpolyilaro.edu.ng

Ahmed Olawale MOLIKI

Department of Political Science

Tai Solarin University of Education

Ijagun, Nigeria

molikiahmedolawale@gmail.com

Abstract. *This study emphasizes on the project affected persons and their perception concerning the activities of government in Lagos State. Lagos Red Rail Line is going to be a laudable project that will enhance socio-economic development of the State and reduce traffic jam when completed. The study employed survey research technique which include administration of interview to the respondents through focus group discussion in Ikeja, Yaba, Mushin and Oyingbo and secondary source of data such as Journals, Internet, Government Gazette, and Magazines. The study reveals that lack of confidence in government coupled with high rate of illiteracy is responsible to the negative reaction of the project affected persons. The study therefore recommends that government at all levels in Lagos State and Nigeria at large should build the confidence of the residents in the State and Nigeria by fulfilling the promises made to residents of Lagos State and Nigerians before and after the elections.*

Keywords: *Lagos State, Government, transportation, Red Rail Line, Project Affected Persons, Properties.*

JEL: D73, H83, H11.

1. Background to the Study

A good transportation system is a key to the growth and development of any society. A good transport system include modern Rail System, Bus Rapid Transit (BRT), Airplane, Ship and Motorized canoe. Apart from conveying passengers from one place to another for social and economic purposes, their presence provides aesthetic to the society where they are cited. The importance of a good transportation system cannot be over emphasized as it contributes to the development of London and some other Cities around the world. Also the presence of Airport and Seaport in Ikeja and Apapa in Nigeria contributed tremendously to the growth and development of those Areas and Lagos State at large. More so, the construction of BRT Lane and Bus Stops result to the beautification and growth of the areas where they are cited. The heavy construction of transportation network system in Lagos State has made the State the hub of Nigeria commercial and economic activities.

According to the Economist Special Report on Nigeria (2015) Lagos State being the largest city in Sub-Saharan Africa is the commercial hub of Nigeria with a metropolitan area population estimated to be around 17 million in 2015, with a growth rate at 4% per year.

Adeniran and Yusuf (2016) affirm that, there is a nexus between transport system and socio-economic changes. They went further to say movement of people, load and level of territorial accessibility are the main thrust of this relationship which create economic opportunities as a result of transportation infrastructure.

Also Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) (2014) reports that a detailed master plan of Lagos on transport system was accomplished in 1980 with year 2000 as its target year. This master plan was reviewed in year 2005 by John Asiyanbi Associates and report that, the master plan that covers individual districts have been instituted and these master plans generically is between year 2010 to 2030. Also the master plan for Lagos Metropolitan Area instituted in December 2009 was concerned with the development of Lagos Rail Transits (LRT) Bus Rapid Transit (BRT), Water transport and Road as its target year. In 2013, there was an institution of a revised master plan which has a draft final report completed in August 2014. The revised master plan has its target year as 2032 with seven-point agenda which inter alia are road and public transportation network plan, logistic plan, non-motorized transport plan, traffic safety plan, climate change plan, economic analysis and proposal of systems (JICA, 2014).

◆ Gab Abolaji Jamiu Atobatele, Olayinka Oluwaseun, Ahmed Olawale Moliki ◆

Also, the assessment system for upper-level development programme for Lagos State and the safeguards policy which were designed by Lagos State Metropolitan Area Transport Authority (LAMATA) that is saddled with the responsibility of implementing LRT were reviewed. There was a pre-evaluations for the LRT blue line and red line whose construction is on-going.

However, Red Line Rail is sponsored by the Lagos State government via LAMATA and assisted by World Bank to improve transport system in the state.

According to Business Day (2020) the long-proposed Lagos Red Line Rail system will kick-start in October 2022, the red line is one of the seven lines proposed in Lagos strategic transport master plan for the mobility of commuters and reduction in grid lock which characterize the State.

However embarking on this project connotes that many properties on the right of way will be affected. In order words, the owners of these affected properties will definitely lose them to the government which will affect their social, economic and psychological life.

Regardless the methods used by the government to acquire peoples' properties, resettlement in most cases causes emotional trauma, untold hardship and disaster in Africa (Cernea, Jackson & Sleigh, Jibril quoted in Agba, Ogaboh , Akpanudoedehe, and Ushie, 2010).

Resettlement leads to community displacement and increase risks of being pauperized by destroying cultural practice, system and way of existences (Cernea, Tan & Yao quoted in Agba, et al, 2010).

ADB, (2014) asserts that compensation should be paid to both title and non-legal ownership, also the groups whose properties are affected, squatters and encroachers whose structures, crops and other assets are destroyed as a result of relocation should equally be compensated adequately.

Ramanathan and Geetha (1998) affirm that Social Economic Impact Assessment of large industrial projects is laudable with a social implication because these projects are liable to affect the socio-economic activities of people, referred to as project-affected people (PAP). It is against this background that this study seeks to examine the impact assessment studies on Lagos Red Rail Line Project and Perception of Project Affected Persons, (PAPs).

2. Literature Review

Many studies have been carried out on transport system and resettlement of project affected persons. Hence this study shall review the literature to see the extent of the project and the reaction of the project Affected persons (PAPs) on the project.

JICA (2014) carried out a study on the “Second Data collection survey on the Mass Rapid Transit in the Federal Republic of Nigeria”. The study reveals that the project evaluation indicators have not been sufficiently examined. The study therefore recommends that sequel to this finding; it has become necessary to garner information that will underpin the development through research.

Adeniran and Yusuf (2016) conducted a research on “Transportation and National Development: Emphasis to Nigeria”. The study finds out that transportation infrastructure will result to economic opportunities. This study recommends that in order to achieving sustainable development, adequate and detailed measures be taken.

Abioye, Shubber and Koenigsberger (2016) carried out a study in evaluating the “Role and Impact of Railway Transport in the Nigerian Economy, options and choices: A Case of Nigerian Railway Corporation”. The study reveals that Nigerian Railway Corporation is confronted with myriads of problem which include dwindling revenue, increasing operational cost and mounting debt. The study therefore request for the private running of the railway.

Wojuade (2016) carried out a research on “Potentials of Light Rail Transit in Nigeria”. The study points out that light rail transit will help to reduce congestion since it has high passengers’ capacity. The study therefore recommends that an effective rail system can be achieved through public private partnership.

Arndt, Morgan, Overman, Clower, Weinstein, & Seman (2009) conducted a study on “Transportation, Social and Economic Impact of Light and Commuter Rail. The study finds out that almost all the federal funding emanates from the U.S. Department of transportation. Blanquant & Koning (2017) conducted a research on the “Local Economic impacts of High-Speed Railways. Theories and Facts”. The study finds out that both the existence and the absence of impacts of HSR, whether these are short term effects on local productivity and the geography of consumption or long term effects on the relocation of business and households and ultimately local growth patterns. The study concludes that the main difficulty is the ability to identify empirically to what degree new infrastructures have affected changes observed in the field, and not on the opposite.

Robinson (2003) carried out a research on “Risks and Rights: The Causes, Consequences and Challenges of Development-Induced Displacement”. The study finds out that government and organizations violate operational directives on involuntary resettlement as well as many social and environmental policies including the indigenous people’s policy. The study therefore recommends that the representative of the Secretary-General and IDP unit should conduct field missions to countries where development- induced displacement is problematic.

Saidu (2009) conducted a study on “An Analysis of Loko Flood Disaster Resettlement Scheme in Song Local Government Area of Adamawa State, Nigeria”. A simple random sampling technique was used to interview 280 household heads by administering a questionnaire to each. The study finds out that the project has not been successful after 19 years of its operation as a result of government failure to identify the needs and hopes and preferences of the victims. The study therefore recommends that scheme beneficiaries should be adequately compensated for the loss of properties. The methodology of this study is ambiguous, needs clarification.

Amnesty International (2014) conducted a study on “At the Mercy of the Government Violation of the Right to an Effective Remedy in Badia East, Lagos State, Nigeria”. The study finds out that, community representatives involved in the RAP discussion from 28th April to 9 May, 2013 told Amnesty International that entitlement matrix was returned to the affected people for consultation as many affected people considered the compensation inadequate for the losses suffered. The study therefore recommends that World Bank should synergize with the Government of Lagos State in order to address the problems identified.

Somalia Regional Corridors Infrastructure Programme (N.D) conducts a research on “Resettlement Action Plan”. The study finds out that Somalia legal requirement is in consonance with the AFDB guidelines in the sense that both parties require fair compensation for the affected persons and set legal framework to resolve conflicts emanating from the lowest level of the court of law. The study recommends that for smooth land acquisition there should be involvement of local leadership most especially Tribal Administration and Country Officials when selecting sites for public infrastructures.

Agba, Akpanudoedehe and Ushie (2010) carried out a study on “Socio-Economic and cultural Impacts of Resettlements on Bakassi People of Cross River State, Nigeria”. The study used a survey research technique in which questionnaires were

purposely administered to Bakassi resettlement site at Ekpiri Ikang in Cross River State. The study reveals that there is significant relationship between Bakassi resettlement and their occupations, culture and inhabitation pattern. The study recommends that affected persons should be adequately compensated.

2.1. Insight into Resettlement and its Cultural, Social and Economic Implications on Project Affected Persons

Resettlement is not expected but it comes often times either naturally or man-made. Resettlement can occur as a result of natural disaster such as flood, earthquake etc. The man-made happens due to construction of bridges, roads, rail line etc. The effect of resettlement on project affected persons can be grave as it affects the cultural, psychological, economic and social status either positively or negatively. According to Agba et al (2010) there is frequent occurrence of resettlement in real life such that it causes major economic losses and cultural disruption to the affected persons.

The government of Nigeria displaced over 250,000 people who were the real indigene of Abuja as result of acquisition of about 800 square kilometer of land for the relocation of federal capital territory (FCT) to Abuja. This affected the place of cultural heritage of this people and other socio-economic activities. Jubril (2006) opines that, this resettlement is responsible for infrastructural inadequacies and land administration problems in FCT.

Olawepo (2008) explains that despite the positive social change in Jebba resettlement, most families lost their jobs, customers, clients and other socio-economic activities.

2.2. Insight into Resettlement Action Plan Objectives

According to Edo State World Bank Assistant Nigeria Erosion and Watershed Management Project (EDO-NEWMAP) (2017). The objective of RAP is to avoid resettlement problems and also look into possible alternatives that will help to reduce or avoid displacement but where land acquisition and involuntary resettlement are inevitable, resettlement and adequate compensation exercise are carried out. More so, the RAP is designed to identify and assess the human impact of the proposed project, prepare an Action plan to be implemented in line with the World Bank Policy and Nigeria Policies and laws.

2.3. Insight into RAP Provisions as Describes in OP 4.12, Paragraphs 2 and 4 of the World Bank

It is expected that a law made in respect of an exercise must have a set of procedure which must be adhered to strictly, hence these are the provision guiding the RAP Exercise.

- A brief description of the project and components for which land acquisition and resettlement are required, and an explanation of why a Resettlement Action Plan is required.
- Legal analysis and framework reviewing the Nigerian laws and regulations and bank policy requirements and measures proposed to bridge any gaps between them; conducting a census and declaring a cut-off date;
- Estimate population displacement and categories of displaced persons, to the extent feasible.
- Eligibility criteria for defining various categories of displaced persons;
- A description of possible mechanisms for transitional costs (such as moving expenses) and for restoring livelihoods where they are adversely affected;
- Organizational procedures for delivery of entitlements, a description of the implementation process, linking resettlement planning and implementation to both civil works and livelihood strategies
- A description of grievance and redress mechanisms that take into account the need for (a) registration of grievances; (b) prompt and transparent action on grievances, (c) due process (d) opportunity for appeal; and (e) avoidance of legal proceedings to the extent possible;
- A description of the arrangements for funding resettlement including the preparation and review of cost estimates, the flow of funds and the contingency arrangements;
- Development of institutional matrix that clearly identifies all the agencies, public or private, that will be involved in the resettlement project, their respective roles, the budget allocated to each and the legal arrangement to be made;
- A description of mechanisms for consultations with and participation of displaced persons in planning, implementation and monitoring; and
- Description of the processes of monitoring, verification and evaluation required for effective implementation of the resettlement process (WEDO-NEWMAP, 2017).

2.4. Insight into Principles Guiding RAP

To ensure that RAP abide by the International best practice, the follow principles must be strictly adhered to:

- Resettlement must be avoided or minimized;
- There must be a genuine consultation;
- There must be establishment of a pre-resettlement baseline data;
- Assistance must be made available during relocation;
- Adequate compensation options must be negotiated;
- Vulnerable social groups must be catered for;
- Resettlement must take place as a development opportunity that ensures that PAPs benefit;
- Resettlement must be seen as an upfront project cost;
- There should be an independent monitoring and grievance procedure in place;
- World Bank's Operational Procedure on forced Resettlement must be adhered to (EDO-NEWMAP, 2017).

3. Methodology

This study employs both primary and secondary sources of data which include interview, Journals, publications, government gazette, Internet etc. The survey research design was employed which include structured interview administered to gather data from the project affected persons (PAPs) in Ikeja, Mushin, Oyingbo & Yaba. The respondents interviewed were between 18 years old and above. The respondents include the property's owners and the tenants.

4. Findings, Recommendation and Conclusion

The study finds out that there was no adequate consultation. The time allocated for consultation was not adequate. The stakeholders in the affected areas which included the chairmen of Community Development Association, Opinion Leaders, Local Government Authorities etc were invited to the meetings in which it was explained to them the plan and aspiration of the government with a directive that the representatives of each community should go home and disseminate the news to their members unfortunately, many affected persons weren't aware of the

development while some CDA chairmen failed to disseminate the information to their members for a reason best known to them. But in all, the time frame for the consultation was inadequate.

Many people do not take government seriously. The respondents were persuaded to give information about themselves but were reluctant because similar exercises have been carried out by the government which did not yield impacts. Many respondents believed that this exercise was just a charade, they will believe when the project is completed.

Falsification of information. Some respondents were afraid to give their information because they were of opinion that their information may be used to process their tax rate. While some gave false information about themselves which include, value of their properties, tenement rate, number of their children etc.

Loss of confidence in the exercise. Some properties' owners and tenants whose properties were not affected wanted their properties to be enumerated at all cost because of the compensation involved while some people whose properties were affected refused to be enumerated.

Lastly, there was mixed feelings. Some respondents were of the view that, the project is not good because it is going to affect their socio-economic activities and properties while some respondents believed that it is going to be a laudable project that will increase socio-economic development of the State.

The study therefore recommends that government at various level should try as much as possible to build confidence in the people by doing the needful.

The study concludes that this project is laudable and promising as it is going to reduce the grid lock and increase economic and social lives of many residents of Lagos. However, many impact assessment exercises have been carried out in the past by the government which did not yield any positive results because of the irresponsible nature of Nigeria leadership coupled with large numbers of illiterate who do not know what the exercise is all about.

References

- Abioye, O., Shubber, K. and Koenigsberger, J., (2016). Evaluating the Role and Impact of Railway Transportation in the Nigerian Economy, Options and Choices: Case of Nigerian Railway Corporation. *AshEse Journal of Economics*, 2(4): pp. 103-113.
- ADB, (2014). REG: Mainstreaming Land Acquisition and Resettlement Safeguards in the Central and West Asian Region. *Technical Assistance Consultant's Report*.
- Adeniran, A.O. and Yusuf, T.B., (2016). Transportation and National Development: Emphasis to Nigeria. *Developing Country Studies*, 7(9).
- .Agba, A.M.O., Akpanudoedehe, J.J. and Ushie, E.M., (2010). Socio-Economic and Cultural Impacts Resettlement on Bakassi People of Cross River State, Nigeria. *Studies in Sociology of Science*, 1(2), pp. 50-62.
- Amnesty International, (2014). *At the Mercy of the Government, Violation of the Right to an Effective Remedy in Badia East, Lagos State Nigeria*.
- Arndt, J.C., Morgan, C., Overman, J., Clover, T., Weinstein, B.L. and Seman, M., (2009). Transportation, Social and Economic Impacts of Light and Commuter Rail. *Texas Department of Transportation*. <http://tti.tamuedu/documents/0-5652-1.pdf>. Accessed on 15th March, 2021.
- Blanquart, C. and Koning, M., (2017). The Local Economic Impacts of High-Speed Railways: Theories and Facts. *European Transport Research Review*, 9(2).
- Business Day, (2020). *Lagos Red Rail Line Becomes Operational*. <https://businessday.ng>.
- Economist Special Report on Nigeria. (2015). www.economist.com.
- EDO-NEWMAP, (2017). Urora Flood and Erosion Intervention Area in Benin City, Edo State. *Resettlement Action Plan-World Bank Document*. <https://documents.worldbank.org>.
- JICA, (2015). *Data Collection Survey on Automotive Sector in the Federal Republic of Nigeria*. Final Report.
- Jubril, I.U., (2006). *Resettlement Issues, Squatter Settlements and the Problems of Land Administration in Abuja, Nigeria's Federal Capital*.
- Olawepo, R.A., (2008). Resettlement and Dynamics of Rural Change in Jebba Lake Basin, Nigeria. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 16(2): pp. 115-120.
- Ramanathan, R. and Geetha, S., (1998). Socio-Economic Impact Assessment of Industrial Projects in India. *Impact Assessment and Project Appraisal*, 16(1): pp. 27-32.
- Robinson, C.W., (2003). Risks and Rights: The Causes, Consequences and Challenges of Development-induced Displacement. *The Bookings Institute-SAIS Project on Internal Displacement*.
- Saidu, B., (2009). An Analysis of Loko Flood Disaster Resettlement Scheme in Song Local Government Area of Adamawa State, Nigeria. *FUTY Journal of the Environment*, 4(1).
- Somalia Regional Corridors Infrastructure Programme. (N.D). *Resettlement Action Plan*. *Somalia Ministry of Public Works, Reconstruction and Housing*.
- Wojuade, C., (2016). Potentials of Light Rail Transit in Nigeria. *International Journal of Management Sciences and Business Research*, 5(12).